

Here is the variation of the Action using the Lagrangian (for a mechanical system)

$$\frac{dA(\varepsilon)}{d\varepsilon} = \left( \int_{t_0}^{t_1} \left( \frac{\partial L}{\partial x} \eta(t) + \frac{\partial L}{\partial \dot{x}} \dot{\eta}(t) \right) dt \right) = 0$$

Now if we were to ensure that both position and velocity varied independently, the **RED** and **BLUE** eta functions MUST be different. Yes, you can probably incorporate the difference into the epsilon (below, I use two different epsilons); however, both epsilons check out of the operation (and so what if the two epsilons are the same?). THEORETICALLY, the two eta functions should NOT be related by a time derivative: they MUST be different.

As an aside, the blue one derived from taking the epsilon derivative of the velocity as follows

$$q(t; \varepsilon) = q(t) + \varepsilon_p \eta(t) \qquad \dot{q}(t; \varepsilon) = \dot{q}(t) + \varepsilon_v \dot{\eta}(t)$$

Let me shift the time derivative on the second term (recognizing ETA still satisfies end points)

$$\int_{t_0}^{t_1} \frac{\partial L}{\partial \dot{x}} \dot{\eta}(t) dt = - \int_{t_0}^{t_1} \frac{d}{dt} \left( \frac{\partial L}{\partial \dot{x}} \right) \eta(t) dt$$

Thus, we get

$$\frac{dA(\varepsilon)}{d\varepsilon} = \int_{t_0}^{t_1} \left( \frac{\partial L}{\partial x} \eta(t) - \frac{d}{dt} \left( \frac{\partial L}{\partial \dot{x}} \right) \eta(t) \right) dt$$

And we set this to zero

$$\int_{t_0}^{t_1} \left( \frac{\partial L}{\partial x} \eta(t) - \frac{d}{dt} \left( \frac{\partial L}{\partial \dot{x}} \right) \eta(t) \right) dt = 0$$

In most books, they now assume the two eta functions are the same

$$\int_{t_0}^{t_1} \left( \left( \frac{\partial L}{\partial x} - \frac{d}{dt} \left( \frac{\partial L}{\partial \dot{x}} \right) \right) \eta(t) \right) dt = 0$$

And they pull out the EL

But I cannot use the above. I must return to this when the two eta functions are different.

$$\int_{t_0}^{t_1} \left( \frac{\partial L}{\partial x} \eta(t) - \frac{d}{dt} \left( \frac{\partial L}{\partial \dot{x}} \right) \eta(t) \right) dt = 0$$

So how do you pull out the E-L now?